

Meeting Minutes for the Governor’s Commission on Access to Sound Basic Education

Tuesday, December 4, 2018

9:30 am – 3:00 pm

NC Department of Public Instruction, Seventh Floor Board Room

In attendance

Dr. Fouad Abd-El-Khalick, Hon. Charles Becton, Ms. Melody Chalmers, Mr. Jim Deal, Mr. Alan Duncan, Hon. Rick Glazier, Mr. Mark Jewell, Ms. Leigh Kokenes, Dr. Helen “Sunny” Ladd, Dr. Patrick Miller, Mr. James Moore, Mr. Mark Richardson, Mr. Nick Sojka, Dr. Stelfanie Williams, Mr. Brad Wilson (Chair), Hon. Leslie Winner, Ms. Henrietta Zalkind

Welcome

The Chair called the meeting to order at 9:30 am and welcomed members. The Chair read the Conflict of Interest statement.

Commission Business and Updates

The Chair presented the minutes from the October 16, 2018 meeting of the Commission and asked if members had any edits. Hearing none, the Chair approved the minutes as presented.

The Chair recognized Dr. Patrick Miller for his recent selection as the 2019 North Carolina Superintendent of the Year.

The Chair also recognized Dr. Fouad Abd-El-Khalick to offer an overview of the Summit on Student Safety and Wellbeing: A Call to Action. The Summit was jointly organized by the UNC Chapel Hill Schools of Education, Medicine, Public Health, and Social Work to bring together and engage in extended discussions key state, national, and international experts on student safety and wellbeing. Summit organizers are developing a roadmap for future action.

The Chair recognized the Hon. Leslie Winner to offer an introduction to the day’s agenda. Ms. Winner noted that the Teacher Workgroup has been guided by the definition of a “competent, certified, well-trained teacher” delineated in the Leandro decision:

“[T]he right to an equal opportunity to obtain a sound basic education requires that each child be afforded the opportunity to attend a public school which has the following educational resources, at a minimum:

First, that every classroom be staffed with a competent, certified, well-trained teacher who is teaching the standard course of study by implementing effective educational methods that provide differentiated, individualized instruction, assessment and remediation to the students in that classroom” [Liability Judgment (April 4, 2002), pp. 109-110; Leandro II, 358 N.C. at 636, 599 S.E.2d at 389].

Ms. Winner reviewed the meeting agenda focused on teacher recruitment, preparation, placement, and induction. She asked Commission members to consider the state’s role in addressing these issues.

To inform the discussion, Ms. Winner noted that Commission members were provided a summary of teacher recruitment and preparation efforts in North Carolina.

Ms. Winner noted that a subsequent meeting will address supporting, developing, retaining, and providing career pathways for teachers. In addition, the Teacher and Finance and Resources Workgroups will address teacher compensation at a joint meeting.

The Chair recognized Mr. Geoff Coltrane, Senior Education Advisor to Governor Cooper, to discuss the North Carolina Teaching Fellows Program. Mr. Coltrane provided an overview of the original program that supported 500 Fellows in seventeen educator preparation programs through 2013. In 2016, a new Teaching Fellows Program was initiated by the North Carolina General Assembly. The program supports up to 200 Fellows in five educator preparation programs. Fellows must be STEM or Special Education majors. Cohort support and enrichment in original program is not funded. Mrs. Chalmers, a former Teaching Fellow from North Carolina A&T State University, noted the importance of the scholarship and cohort enrichment.

Dr. Ladd requested information on Fellow selection and placement. In response, Dr. Kevin Bastian, Associate Director and Research Associate, Education Policy Initiative at Carolina, Public Policy, University of North Carolina Chapel Hill, shared information from an evaluation of the distribution and effectiveness in the original NC Teaching Fellows Programs. The schools in which Fellows taught after graduation were more advantaged. When comparing student state assessment results, Teaching Fellows were more effective than other early career teachers and non-Fellows at the same schools.

The State of Teaching in North Carolina

The Chair recognized Dr. Tom Tomberlin, Director of District Human Resources, North Carolina Department of Public Instruction for a presentation of data on teacher attrition and mobility in North Carolina in the 2016-17 school year. Dr. Tomberlin noted that the average 8.7 percent rate of attrition is comparable to other industries, but it is not uniformly distributed geographically, by school type or wealth, or by teacher experience level.

Dr. Williams requested additional information on attrition among beginning teachers. Dr. Tomberlin noted that among the 21,276 beginning teachers in NC (those with fewer than three years of teaching experience), the attrition rate is 12 percent. Dr. Tomberlin also highlighted retention concerns among experienced teachers with 10 or more years of experience.

Mr. Jewell and Dr. Ladd noted concern about the performance measures included in the report. Dr. Fouad Abd-El-Khalick noted the importance of taking specific action to appropriately identify and retain effective teachers and to deliberately recognize and support developing teachers.

Schools and districts also experience attrition as the combined effect of teacher attrition from the state and mobility of teachers from one district to another district or charter school. The average effect of the district-attrition rate for the state is 14 percent, though this rate varies widely by district. Some districts are taken specific, successful actions to recoup teachers.

The Chair recognized Dr. Kevin Bastian, Associate Director, Education Policy Initiative at Carolina, for a presentation on the educator preparation pipeline in North Carolina. Dr. Bastian shared that 50 percent of North Carolina's current teachers are prepared by NC's institutions of higher education, 22 percent are from out-of-state, and 17 percent are prepared through alternative entry programs.

Alternative entry routes are the fastest growing the state. They enroll higher percentages of male and minority candidate. Alternative entry teachers (relative to traditionally prepared) more likely to work in middle and high schools; more likely to work in schools with higher percentages of economically-

disadvantaged and minority students, and in schools with lower performance composites, and are more likely to hold licenses in science, math, and Exceptional Children.

Currently, alternative entry candidates must successfully complete initial testing, be hired by a school system, affiliate with a college or university with an approved teacher education program in the license area or with a Regional Alternative Licensing Centers to complete an individual plan of study, and successfully complete final testing.

Since 2009, EPIC has biennially assessed the performance and retention of teachers entering the profession through these different pathways/portals. Dr. Bastian noted the following findings:

- When examining Value-Added results, UNC System teachers more effective than other large sources of teachers in multiple comparisons
- UNC System teachers earn higher evaluation ratings than other large sources of teachers. They are outperformed by Teach for America corps members.
- Approximately 84 percent of in-state prepared teachers return for a 3rd year; 72% returning for a 5th year. By comparison, these values are 68 percent and 48 percent for out-of-state and 70 percent and 50 percent for alternative entry

Mr. Sojka noted that UNC system graduates are working in schools that are more economically advantaged, less diverse, and more academically successful and the Commission must develop a system that responds to meet the mandate of Leandro.

Teacher Recruitment and Preparation in North Carolina

The Chair recognized Dr. Charles Coble to facilitate a panel discussion among educator preparation program leaders. Dr. Coble introduced Dr. Ann Bullock, Dean, School of Education, Elon University; Dr. Teresa Petty, Associate Dean, Cato College of Education, University of North Carolina at Charlotte; Dr. Melba Spooner, Dean, Reich College of Education, Appalachian State University; and Dr. Miriam Wagner, Dean, College of Education, North Carolina Agricultural and Technical State University.

During the discussion, the panelists shared their views on multiple issues impacting teacher recruitment and preparation in North Carolina, including:

- The importance of public school and school of education partnerships to preparing and retaining teachers;
- Individual school of education efforts to recruit students to become teachers;
- The effects of a lack of prestige for the teaching profession and low compensation on recruiting teachers;
- The importance of immersing pre-service teachers into school and classroom experiences while they are in college;
- The need to identify what competencies the state expects of teachers when they complete their pre-service education programs.

Effective Practices in Beginning Teacher Induction and Support

The Chair recognized Dr. Linda Darling-Hammond, President and CEO, Learning Policy Institute and Charles E. Ducommun Professor of Education Emeritus, Stanford University for a presentation on effective practices to improve novice teacher performance and retention. Dr. Darling-Hammond noted that declines in compensation, support, and working conditions have reduced the attractiveness of the profession. Effective induction support can double retention rates and improve performance. Elements of

high-quality induction include coaching from a trained mentor, common planning time with teachers in the same subject or grade level, reduced teaching load, seminars on key issues, supportive communications with administrator(s), and extra classroom assistance.

The Chair recognized Dr. Patrick Conetta, Director of Teacher Induction and Development, North Carolina New Teacher Support Program (NC NTSP) for a presentation on the elements and outcomes. Dr. Conetta reported that the NC NTSP is a comprehensive, university-based induction program offering a research-based curriculum and multiple services designed to increase teacher effectiveness, enhance skills, and reduce attrition among beginning teachers. The NC NTSP provides each teacher: (1) intensive Institute “boot camps”; (2) intensive, individualized classroom coaching; & (3) aligned professional development sessions.

The NC NTSP currently works in partnership with nine public universities, 53 school districts, 250 schools, and 1,050 teachers. All participating schools are high needs based on socioeconomic status, rate of teacher turnover, and/or level of teacher experience.

Teachers served by the NC NTSP are significantly more likely to return to teach in their school and LEA than a matched sample of teachers not supported by NC NTSP. Teachers served by the NC NTSP in their second and third year performed significantly higher in all five areas of their NCEES evaluation than teachers not supported by NC NTSP. Teachers served by the NC NTSP in their second and third year significantly outperformed teachers not supported by NC NTSP in student achievement in Elementary, middle, and high school (EVAAS). 80 percent of teachers served by the NC NTSP felt their Instructional Coach helped them with the confidence, knowledge, and skills in teaching, compared to district/school support (66.8%).

During discussion, Commission members expressed concern that state funds were not used to serve highest need schools and districts. The Chair asked Dr. Conetta to provide additional information about program costs and projected expansion costs.

Dr. Ladd requested information on high quality induction programs in the United States and internationally.

Strategic Approaches to Teacher Recruitment, Retention, and Advancement

The Chair recognized Jane Turner, Executive Director, Center for Educator Recruitment, Retention, and Advancement (CERRA) for a presentation on the Center’s work to recruit, retain, and support teachers in South Carolina. Ms. Turner reported that the Center was established in 1985 by the South Carolina Commission on Higher Education out of a concern about the state teacher supply pool and the need for a centralized teacher recruitment effort. The organization continues to operate independently with oversight by the Commission, the CERRA Board of Directors, and the South Carolina General Assembly. CERRA is hosted by Winthrop University in Rock Hill, South Carolina.

CERRA receives \$12,772,487 in state funding through three dedicated line items in the state budget: 1. CERRA programs and services; 2. Teaching Fellows and Teacher Cadets; and 3. Rural Recruitment Initiative in thirty-six districts.

CERRA operates an array of coordinated programs across the teacher pipeline – ProTeam; Teacher Cadets; Teaching Fellows; Mentoring and Induction Training; Teacher Forum; National Board Certification Support; Rural Recruitment Initiative; Veterans to Teachers Initiative; and Online Educator Employment System.

CERRA is the only organization strictly focused on work, communication, and research around educator recruitment, retention, and acceleration. Districts, colleges, and universities see CERRA as a partner and service provider. It is helpful that CERRA is neither regulatory nor political – it is a partner. The coordination of programs allows CERRA to build a professional educator pipeline. CERRA staff focus a great deal of effort on recruitment and communication. For example, students are recruited into Teacher Cadets. Cadets are recruited into Teaching Fellows (79 percent of students who applied for admission into the Teaching Fellows Program were Teacher Cadets).

Discussion and Next Steps

The Chair recognized Dr. Eric Hall, Deputy State Superintendent of Innovation, North Carolina Department of Public Instruction, who welcomed Commission members.

The Chair noted that the next meeting of the full Commission would be held on January 17, 2019.

The meeting was adjourned by the Chair at 3:00 pm.